

HISTORY OF SCIENCE SOCIETY
COMMITTEE ON MEETINGS AND PROGRAMS (CoMP)
GUIDELINES FOR EVALUATING
PROPOSALS

Please note the following regarding all proposals and participants:

- All meeting participants must register for the meeting and pay the registration fee (there will be a reduced registration fee for those participating remotely). If you are organizing a session, please ensure that all of your participants register by the deadline or they will be removed from the program.
- Nobody may appear in more than one regular session at a single meeting. Exceptions may be granted as detailed below – as a rule, no one may appear more than twice on the program.
- Because we value diversity, we ask for information on gender, institutional affiliation, and age cohort. Please note that supplying this data is **optional**.

INDIVIDUAL PAPER PROPOSALS

- A. In evaluating individual proposals for possible inclusion in general sessions created by the Program Chairs from “contributed papers” submissions:
- (a) The principal criterion will be the quality of the proposal.
 - (b) A second factor of substantial weight will be the need to bring balance to the program.
 - (c) No person, but for the most exceptional circumstances (to be cleared with the chair of CoMP), may appear on the program twice (as presenter of a paper, commentator, or discussant). A person may, however, serve more than one function in a single session—e.g., as chair and presenter or commentator or discussant or as a presenter in a special panel. Also, a person is exempt from the stricture against duplication if he or she serves only as an organizer or chair of another session or is a presenter in a special gathering such as a poster session, workshop or plenary session.
 - (d) When proposal quality and program balance are equal among submissions, the program chairs will give priority to those who did not appear on the two previous years’ programs. Poster presenters in prior meetings are exempt from this provision.

NOTE The Program Chairs will reserve a block of sessions for “contributed papers,” primarily, but not solely, by graduate students.

SESSION PROPOSALS

- B. In evaluating sessions that organizers submit as wholes and whose proposals support unified themes:

- (a) The principal criterion will be the importance of the topic and the perceived quality of the proposals and their integration into a meaningful and useful session.
- (b) Another criterion will be the need for balance in the subjects covered on the program.
- (c) Another factor will be sponsorship by an official HSS interest group or committee (one session only).
- (d) An additional factor will be involvement of participants representing diversity of institutional affiliations, gender, and career stage.
- (e) No person, but for the most exceptional circumstances (to be cleared with the chair of CoMP), may appear on the program twice (as presenter of a paper, commentator, or discussant). A person may, however, serve more than one function in a single session—e.g., as chair and presenter or commentator or discussant or as a presenter in a special panel. Also, a person is exempt from the stricture against duplication if he or she serves only as an organizer or chair of another session or is a presenter in a special gathering such as a poster session, workshop or plenary session.
- (f) When proposal quality and program balance are equal among submissions, the program chairs will give priority to those who did not appear on the two previous years' programs.

NOTE: For inclusion on the official program, the following activities require regular applications as sessions:

- public forums or speakers sponsored by HSS interest groups and committees
- honorific sessions sponsored by members' colleagues
- commemorations of historic events
- plenary sessions
- other special gatherings

Program Chairs will judge these submissions along with other sessions on their merits. (Of course, official HSS interest groups and committees remain welcome to mount special programs in the time-slots normally allocated for their business meetings. Similarly, HSS members remain welcome to organize private activities independent of the official program.)

POSTER PROPOSALS

C. In evaluating posters:

- (a) The principal criterion will be the quality of the proposal.
- (b) Poster presentations should be principally “extra-textual.” These can be images, artifacts, even “experiments.” Displays must serve as the lynchpin for some kind of point (if not an argument) that can be conveyed in a short oral explication/demonstration.
- (c) Another factor of substantial weight will be the need to bring balance to the program.
- (d) Poster presenters are exempt from the no-duplicate-appearance rule.

- (e) To encourage poster submissions, CoMP voted in 2009 not to penalize those who presented a poster in a prior year when selecting papers. That is, if X presented a poster in 2016, then the program chairs should not have that enter into consideration when judging X's paper for 2017.

While judging contributed paper submissions, the program chairs will keep in mind whether or not the submission might make a good poster. Sometimes, worthy proposals are declined because they cannot be grouped with other papers to form a session.

ROUNDTABLE PROPOSALS

- D. A note on roundtables: Roundtables are structurally different sessions from the regular paper-presentation sessions. The goal is to promote discussion between the audience and the panel. Discussion is the goal – not listening to papers. A good chair is often the difference between a dynamic, engaging session and a tedious slog. Presenters should limit their “presentation” to 10 minutes.
 - (a) The principal criterion will be the quality of the proposal.
 - (b) Another criterion will be the need for balance in the subjects covered on the program.
 - (c) Another factor will be sponsorship by an official HSS interest group or committee (one session only).
 - (d) An additional factor will be involvement of participants representing diversity of institutional affiliations and gender.
 - (e) No person, but for the most exceptional circumstances (to be cleared with the chair of CoMP), may appear on the program twice (as presenter of a paper, commentator, or discussant). A person may, however, serve more than one function in a single session—e.g., as chair and presenter or commentator or discussant or as a presenter in a special panel. Also, a person is exempt from the stricture against duplication if he or she serves only as an organizer or chair of another session or is a presenter in a special gathering such as a poster session, workshop or plenary session.
 - (f) When proposal quality and program balance are equal among submissions, the program chairs will give priority to those who did not appear on the two previous years' programs.

PRESIDENT'S SESSION FLASH TALK PROPOSALS

- E. This new session format is intended to allow students to share and discuss the fundamentals of works in varying degrees of progress. Each participant will be allowed five minutes for a presentation (with one optional slide), followed by ten minutes of discussion/Q&A with the audience. Up to 10 flash talks will be selected for this session.
 - (a) Only graduate students may present a flash talk.

- (b) No person, but for the most exceptional circumstances (to be cleared with the chair of CoMP), may appear on the program twice (as presenter of a paper, commentator, roundtabler, or discussant).
- (c) Flash talk proposals will be reviewed and selected by the HSS President.

WORKSHOPS, FIELD TRIPS, SITE VISITS

F. In evaluating workshops, field trips, or site visits:

- (a) The principal criterion will be the activity's relevance to the Society's collective goals.
- (b) A related issue will be the activity's logistical feasibility.
- (c) Another factor of importance will be the need to bring balance to the program.
- (d) A final aspect will be sponsorship by an official HSS interest group or committee, including the local arrangements committee.

NOTE: The program chairs will reserve periods during Friday evening for workshops, field trips, site visits, and related activities.

G. Audio Visual Needs: Those who propose a paper are asked to identify their a/v needs. All rooms will be equipped with an LCD projector (beamer) and screen. Sound, internet access, etc., must be requested 8 weeks in advance. Please note that there may be a charge to provide such services.

H. Please submit your proposals online at <https://www.openconf.org/hss2017/>.